

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**LIBERAL–NATIONAL GOVERNMENT —  
ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL PLAN FOR WESTERN AUSTRALIA**

*Standing Orders Suspension — Motion*

**MR M. MCGOWAN (Rockingham — Leader of the Opposition)** [10.49 am] — without notice: I move —

That so much of standing orders be suspended so as to allow the following motion to be moved forthwith —

That this house condemns the Liberal–National government for the collapse of coherent cabinet government resulting in the lack of an economic and financial plan for Western Australia.

This is a matter of some urgency, and I will explain to the house why. We just saw the Treasurer introduce a bill to borrow another \$1.7 billion. That is on top of the bill last year to borrow \$8 billion in order for government to function. The government is now going to run out of money. The state of Western Australia under the Liberal–National government is going to run out of money in October if these laws are not introduced. We are at the end of August and the government is introducing legislation so that it can continue to function. It must be passed by October or else we are going to run out of money. What a shambles of a government! What a hopeless government that we are now in this dire financial position after eight years of its profligate, hopeless rule. It comes on top of other recent developments, such as the lack of coherent, proper management of the cabinet. We have the National Party at war with itself. We have the National Party at war with the Liberal Party. We have Liberal Party ministers at war with one another. Then there is the revelation today, which I will go into if the Leader of the House agrees to this suspension, that the transport minister cannot get an appointment to see the Premier. The transport minister of Western Australia has said that he cannot get a meeting with the Premier of Western Australia. The Deputy Premier shakes her head, but she is just as responsible. Every single Liberal and National minister is responsible for this shambles in Western Australia.

*Point of Order*

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** I think the Leader of the Opposition is getting into the substance of what he wants to talk about rather than really making the case as to why standing orders should be very unusually suspended. However, so as to not waste the time of the house, we will agree to a maximum of 20 minutes for government members and 20 minutes for non-government members. I indicate that if the Leader of the Opposition sits down, I will move that.

**THE SPEAKER:** Leader of the Opposition, are you happy with 20 minutes each way?

**Mr M. MCGOWAN:** I am satisfied with 20 minutes a side in relation to this issue. Other members might have a view. I think it deserves longer than that in light of recent developments, but if the government wants to truncate debate to 20 minutes a side, we would accept that. Other members might have a view.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** I think it is only fair that as the only Independent member of this chamber, I have the opportunity to speak on this very important motion on the financial state that we face in Western Australia.

**Mr J.H.D. Day:** You can speak. No-one is stopping you speaking.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Under normal practices I would not get the normal five minutes that Independents get with a matter of public interest because this is not an MPI. I would like to move an amendment that five minutes be allocated to the Independent members should they so choose. I would like to move that amendment. I would like to get an indication from the Leader of the House whether he is prepared to accept that amendment.

**Mr J.H.D. Day:** No.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** He is not. Okay. We have seen the shambles that this Leader of the House has caused in this chamber over the last two days. Disgraceful! He has been gagging debates on very important issues. I will take the opportunity just to say a few words —

**Mrs L.M. Harvey** interjected.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Why don't you be quiet!

**The SPEAKER:** Thank you! Deputy Premier! Let us just get some normalcy back into this. Basically, the Leader of the House is not prepared to extend —

**Mr J.H.D. Day:** I will, being as generous as I am.

**The SPEAKER:** It has been extended by five minutes.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** So I will get five minutes to speak on the motion?

**The SPEAKER:** That is right.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Thank you.

*Standing Orders Suspension — Amendment to Motion*

**MR J.H.D. DAY (Kalamunda — Leader of the House)** [10.54 am]: I move to add to the motion -

To insert after “forthwith” —

, subject to the debate being limited to 20 minutes for government members, 20 minutes for non-government members and five minutes, if necessary, for Independent members.

Amendment put and passed.

*Standing Orders Suspension — Motion, as Amended*

**The SPEAKER:** Members, as this is a motion without notice to suspend standing orders, it will need the support of an absolute majority for it to proceed. If I hear a dissentient voice, I will be required to divide the Assembly.

Question put and passed with an absolute majority.

*Motion*

**MR M. MCGOWAN (Rockingham — Leader of the Opposition)** [10.55 am]: I move the motion.

Earlier today the Treasurer moved the Loan Bill 2016—another \$1.7 billion worth of borrowing just to allow the general government sector of Western Australia to continue to operate. The Liberal–National government passed an \$8 billion loan bill last year—\$8 billion!—in order to allow the ordinary business of government to continue to operate, and that money is going to run out in October. Without this new Loan Bill, the business of government will stop in Western Australia. That is how incompetent and catastrophic the management of this state has been—we now have an unprecedented nearly \$10 billion of additional borrowings in the course of one year just to allow the ordinary business of government to continue to function. I think it is appropriate that on this day, when this catastrophic piece of information has come forward, we suspend the standing orders to discuss the incompetent and irresponsible management of Western Australia under the Barnett Liberal–National government. Is it any wonder that the state is now in this position, considering the breakdown of cabinet government in this state? I have never seen anything like it in the history of this country, where we have the National Party at war with itself; we have the National Party at war with the Liberal Party; we have the National Party proposing a huge new tax in Western Australia; we have Liberal Party ministers at war with one another; and we have Liberal Party ministers—the transport minister and the Treasurer—having secret meetings in Shenton Park to discuss the future of the Premier of Western Australia. The transport minister said in July this year that there was no reason to change from the Premier “right at this point”. The Treasurer of Western Australia, when discussing the internal turmoil inside the government, said —

“It could be numerous things but it isn’t coming from the backbench.”

The clear implication of that statement is that it is coming from the frontbench. There is this internal disputation between the Treasurer and the transport minister of this government. It is divided; it is dysfunctional; it is chaotic—that is the government of Western Australia. If any greater evidence was ever needed, it has come today, when the transport minister of Western Australia admitted publicly that he has been trying to get a meeting with the Premier of Western Australia for weeks and that he cannot get one. This is the transport minister, who is responsible for billions of dollars of government projects, and the Premier refuses to meet him. How can government function in Western Australia when it is so divided, so dysfunctional and so chaotic that the Premier of Western Australia will not meet with his transport minister, who is responsible for billions of dollars of government contracts? This is an unprecedented level of chaos and, I suspect, dislike between the Premier and his ministers. How is that playing out? Across Western Australia, the community and the business community are sick and tired of the management of this state by this government. We hear it everywhere and see evidence of it everywhere, but is there any greater evidence than the figures that came out last week that showed that the unemployment rate in Western Australia is now higher than the unemployment rate in Tasmania? The Premier was offering himself up to go and run Tasmania a few years ago. These days they would not give him a permit to enter! Western Australia has 6.3 per cent unemployment; Tasmania has 6.2 per cent. That translates to 90 300 unemployed Western Australians. People across the community and in the business community are saying that there is no coherent economic narrative or plan by the Liberal–National government. There is no plan by the Liberal–National government to deal with the unemployment crisis confronting our state. Only Labor has a plan for jobs.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Members! Members for North West Central and Cockburn—there is a whole lot of you now—I do not want to hear from you again. I want to hear the Leader of the Opposition.

**Mr M. McGOWAN:** The Liberal–National government does not have a narrative, a plan or a way of dealing with the economic crisis confronting Western Australia, which is manifested by an unemployment rate higher than that in Tasmania. Only Labor has a plan for jobs. The government is not capable of producing one because its cabinet is divided and dysfunctional and its members are at war with one another.

**Mr V.A. Catania** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for North West Central, I have been very lenient with you. I call you to order for the first time.

**Mr M. McGOWAN:** A shocking situation confronts the people of this state. Let us then go to the debt and deficit situation confronting our state. As we have said, when the government arrived in office, the state's debt was \$3.6 billion. By 2019–20, it will be \$40.2 billion—more than a thousand per cent increase in debt under the auspices of this government. It is now above \$30 billion on its watch. We have a deficit of \$3.9 billion—higher than the totality of the debt accumulated in the 108 years in the lead-up to the formation of this government. This government has created a catastrophic situation in Western Australia. Recently, we have seen some evidence that the public out there is working out that the situation that now confronts our state is the fault of this government. Then it comes to the magic solution that was proposed—the privatisation solution. The National Party will not support the sale of Fremantle port, so that will not happen, and it appears that the Premier does not support the sale of Western Power. The government is divided and dysfunctional, and any solutions it comes up with are shot down internally before they even start.

**Mr V.A. Catania** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for North West Central! Leader of the Opposition, carry on.

**Mr M. McGOWAN:** This is the situation that the state now finds itself in. We have a government with no plan, no cohesion and no leadership. We have a Premier without the courage to deal with the internal issues that have confronted him, and we saw that in his attitude towards the National Party. We have a Premier who has not shown the courage to deal with the disputation within his cabinet, and we will see whether he has the courage over the course of the next day. We have a Premier who clearly does not want to be here, but he does not have faith in any of his potential Liberal Party successors.

**Mr A. Krsticevic** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Carine, I call you to order.

**Mr M. McGOWAN:** He does not have faith in any of his potential Liberal Party successors, so he is hanging on by his fingertips until after the next election.

**Mrs L.M. Harvey** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Deputy Premier!

**Mr M. McGOWAN:** Even then, the Premier's plan is this: wreck the finances, create the worst unemployment on record, and then, after the next election, retire, leaving the mess for whoever is there to pick it up. That is the Liberal Party's plan for Western Australia, and the public of Western Australia has worked it out and it has worked the government out. That is the mess it has left this state in. It is just writ large—I repeat—by the hatred, the lack of capacity to work together, the undermining and the different policy positions publicly expressed by members of cabinet. The Premier allows it all to happen on a daily basis because he will not rein in cabinet ministers. He will not say, "This is the plan" or "This is the process." He will not even meet with cabinet ministers. It is dysfunctional; it is hopeless. It cannot be allowed to continue, because the people of the state of Western Australia are the ones who are suffering as a consequence of this failure—this inability of the cabinet of Western Australia to even work together.

**MR J.H.D. DAY (Kalamunda — Leader of the House)** [11.06 am]: There is no way that we support this motion. It is pretty rich coming from the —

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Thank you. Member for Bassendean!

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** It is pretty cowardly coming from the opposition on a day that the Premier is not here because he is in the Pilbara fulfilling his duties as Premier of the state—the Pilbara is an important part of the state where an enormous amount has happened since this government came into office in September 2008.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**Mr P.B. Watson** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Albany, you were very indignant when I did not call the member for North West Central. I am giving you a chance. Stop shouting out.

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** It is pretty rich coming from the opposition and from the Labor Party, given the record that they had when they were in government, with one minister after another being brought before the Corruption and Crime Commission, and the chaos and the dishonesty —

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Thank you; wall of noise. Member for Cockburn!

**Dr A.D. Buti** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Armadale, I call you to order for the first time.

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** — and the control that certain individuals had over the Labor government when Labor was in office before. Remember Brian Burke ringing up and speaking to ministers. He would say, “Jump” and they would say, “How high?”

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Members!

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** That is the path the Labor Party is going down again—the very cosy deals.

**Ms R. Saffioti** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for West Swan, I call you to order for the first time.

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** Very cosy deals existed between the Labor Party and certain business interests back in the late 1980s and the early 1990s, and reflected again when Labor was in government again, particularly from 2005 through to 2008.

**Ms R. Saffioti** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for West Swan.

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** We are seeing the union control and domination of the Labor Party and the Labor government coming through again and the —

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Members!

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** — union movement, the backroom operators and the union heavies.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Girrawheen, I call you to order for the first time. Member for Armadale, I call you to order for the second time. Member for Warnbro, you were also very indignant when I was not calling the member for North West Central, so now you have just had a chance as well.

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** The union heavies and their puppets in the Labor Party are salivating at the prospect of a union-controlled Labor government getting back into office and not acting in the interests of workers or the wider community but doing very cosy deals with certain business operators around town, just the way it did before. That is the only way the modern Labor Party knows how to operate. Labor is very keen to receive donations from certain interests. It is very keen to put the public interest aside and do preferential deals to its own advantage.

Several members interjected.

*Point of Order*

**Ms M.M. QUIRK:** The Leader of the House is reflecting on the reputation of us all. Unless he can name specifics, I suspect he should shut up.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Have you finished your point of order?

**Ms M.M. QUIRK:** Yes.

*Debate Resumed*

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** I know a few people around town are not happy that because of the circumstances brought about through no fault of this government we had to find a means to raise additional revenue two years ago. We needed to increase land tax. No-one likes increasing taxes, but given the government's very narrow tax base, we have had little alternative.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Mandurah, please. I call you to order for the first time. The Leader of the Opposition was heard in relative silence, so let us have a bit of leeway both ways.

**Mr J.H.D. DAY:** In the context that we have had a record low share of the national goods and services tax collection and a substantial decrease in revenue as a result of decreased royalty income, we have had no alternative but to seek ways to find revenue so that we can pay our nurses, teachers, police, doctors, child protection workers, prison officers and so on at the high level that they deserve and have become used to in recent years. That is the reason for the state's financial pressure at the moment. It is not because of what is being spent on capital works projects; it is a question of not having the revenue that we need to pay expenses—primarily, the salaries of public servants.

I would like to know the Labor Party's plan and how it believes it will address this issue. It is running around promising everything to everyone, but as we get closer to the election, a few questions will need to be asked of, and answered by, the Labor Party about its plan, rather than its members just holding up glossy booklets and so on. The Labor Party is very good at making announcements and putting up signs, but it is not very good at delivering projects. Since this government has been in office and under the leadership of Premier Colin Barnett, the member for Cottesloe, we have seen a determination to get the state moving to complete projects that in some cases have been talked about for decades or, in the case of the Perth City Link project, a century. The Labor Party announced it and had glossy brochures and so on, but it never did it. I remember the Labor Party talking about proposed hospital projects; it put up signs, but it never did them. These projects have been completed. There is a \$7 billion rebuild of the public hospital system and a substantial expansion of the public transport system, which is happening, including the Forrestfield–Airport rail link. These projects had been talked about for years and under the direction and leadership of the member for Cottesloe, they are being completed. If people do not like that sort of record and the transformation of the city and regional centres in Western Australia, they need to front up and say so.

The record of this government is strong and proud. We are focused on providing good government to the state and we will continue to do so.

**MR R.F. JOHNSON (Hillarys)** [11.14 am]: In prefacing my remarks, I say that it is essential that every member in this house has the right to speak on any motion or any debate on behalf of the residents whom they represent. Despite the Leader of the House trying to gag me —

Several members interjected.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** He was not going to accept the amendment until he got wiser counsel from people around him who said, "No, you better let him speak." I am appreciative to those people who gave the Leader of the House that advice.

If we do not learn from history, we are bound to repeat it. This government is bringing up stuff from 30 years ago. WA Inc was a disgraceful time. I am the first to admit that. Over the last few years we have been heading towards another WA Inc. If anybody cannot sleep at night, I suggest they look up *Hansard* and look at the speeches I have made—my responses to budget speeches and Addresses-in-Reply—and they will see what I have predicted for the last four years.

Several members interjected.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Mr Speaker, please protect me from those hooligans over there.

**The SPEAKER:** Please sit down, member for Hillarys. I hear a lot of noise. I am battling to hear the member for Hillarys. I do not want the wall of noise.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Some of them cannot handle —

**Mr S.K. L'Estrange** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Churchlands, I call you to order for the first time.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** I will simply not succumb to bullying, I assure members. If members get bored and cannot sleep, read the speeches I have made. For the last four years, I have predicted—three years ago, two years ago and now—exactly where we would be and the financial crisis that faces us. We are now borrowing money to pay

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

wages. That was happening many years ago. What a disgraceful situation for this government to be in. The Premier has been spending money like a drunken sailor.

**Mr P.T. Miles** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Wanneroo, I call you to order for the first time.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** I have predicted for the last four years—every single year—what the state debt would be; we are now nudging \$40 billion.

**Dr K.D. Hames** interjected.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Why don't you be quiet, you nasty little person who double dips into the public purse!

**The SPEAKER:** Let us keep it through the Chair.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Let me predict this: as there are no plans to cut expenditure, even if we sell assets, the state debt within the next three years will be \$50 billion. Members should wait and see. I have been right so far. I was right about losing the AAA credit rating. I was right about the level of debt nudging \$40 billion. I was right about the tens of thousands of people who have lost their jobs. I was right about all those things and the budget deficit that we now face.

**Mrs L.M. Harvey:** The Premier was right to sack you.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Look, do not try to be relevant, minister. You are not relevant. You have got no real support. You can laugh and smile and it will not get you anywhere. You might get away with it with some suckers, but you will not get away with it with people who have brains.

At the end of the day —

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** That is enough! Member for Dawesville, that is enough. I call you to order for the first time.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Some members are asking how I would address the debt. What would I do? I have already addressed that. I certainly would not be putting a \$5 tax on our major mining corporations. That would see even more tens of thousands of jobs lost. Why would we tax business? Conservative governments never tax business up to the hilt such as this government is trying to do now. The Liberal Party does not want to do it, but the National Party wants to do it or at least the Leader of the National Party wants to do it. I do not think every member of the National Party wants to do it. They will nod their heads and show unity—God bless you; good luck to you. You are getting it in your party; you do not get it in that party. At the end of the day, if the government starts taxing business —

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Warnbro and Minister for Regional Development, this is not your debate. Let us hear from the member for Hillarys.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

If the National Party starts taxing the hell out of businesses, it will see tens of thousands of jobs go out the window. This state cannot afford that. We have record unemployment in this state—I think it is the highest rate in the last 30 years. The government has to take responsibility for that. If the government wants to sell assets, good—sell assets. However, it should not sell strategic or income-bearing assets. Sell the stadium! If that is such a wonderful asset, sell the stadium! The government will not find a buyer for it—not in a million years—because it will be a loss-making, subsidised liability for this state for decades to come. For decades to come it will have to be subsidised by whichever government is in power after next March.

I have also put forward the suggestion that if the government wants to save money, it should abolish royalties for regions. This government is spending \$1 billion a year on a thought bubble—a policy. It was a great idea from the National Party. It got it elected and gave it the balance of power in 2008. I have always said it was a great policy for the National Party to get elected—absolutely. However, it is a cost that we cannot afford. We cannot afford \$1 billion. It is discriminatory. It discriminates against metropolitan —

**Ms M.J. Davies** interjected.

**Mr R.F. JOHNSON:** Please do not interject. I get five minutes; that is all, and I have two minutes left.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Thank you! The question is that the motion be agreed to. The Treasurer.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**DR M.D. NAHAN (Riverton — Treasurer)** [11.20 am]: Mr Speaker —

An opposition member interjected.

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** I am not going to take political advice from this person, who parachutes into a seat from Cottesloe or wherever he lives.

I thank members opposite for bringing up this motion. I think they have forgotten why they lost the 2008 election.

**Ms L. Mettam:** They did nothing!

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** Exactly. The former Labor government was awash with money. It had the largest windfall revenue in the state's history. Transfer fees went up from \$500 million a year when the Labor government first came in and peaked at \$2.5 billion. Payroll tax was growing at 12 to 15 per cent a year. The government was awash with money. However, what did it do with it?

Government members: Nothing!

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** The Labor government was going to do something, but it did not. It did a few things—this is important. It built Perth Arena, at three times the initial cost. It put some money aside for Fiona Stanley Hospital, at four times the cost. It built the Mandurah railway, at twice the cost.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Mandurah, I was hoping you would stop, but you will not. I call you to order for the second time.

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** At the 2008 election, the Labor government belatedly said, “We have to do something; let's promise some more”, and it promised “Dubai on the Swan”—Elizabeth Quay, in other words. It also promised a stadium, Fiona Stanley Hospital, and a new Perth Museum. The theme was “Carps the Builder”.

**Mr S.K. L'Estrange:** And “Spaghetti-net”!

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** No. That was second one. It also proposed a massive \$11 billion increase in debt. We cannot build those things without borrowing.

**Mr P. Papalia** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Warnbro!

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** The reason we came from nowhere and won the 2008 election is because we committed to build the infrastructure that is needed in the state.

Government members: Hear, hear!

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** That is what we did. We did not build “Dubai on the Swan” in our first term. We did not build the stadium in our first term. We built Fiona Stanley hospital, on budget and on time. We are building the new Museum. We are building the infrastructure of this state. As the Treasurer responsible for the debt associated with that, I am not backing off from that. These people opposite would have liked us not to do that, because that would have meant that we lost the subsequent election. But we did not do that. We did what was needed and what the people of this state wanted, and we won that election. We won the 2013 election with the largest margin ever.

Several members interjected.

*Withdrawal of Remark*

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Willagee! Member for Armadale! I want you to withdraw that. You said, “You lied.”

**Mr P.C. TINLEY:** Mr Speaker, I said they are Liberal lies. I was referring to the Liberal Party, not individuals.

**The SPEAKER:** Thank you. I will improve my hearing, then, member for Willagee. Be careful what you say, member for Armadale.

*Debate Resumed*

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** Within a few months of coming to government, in our first term, we had the GFC. We managed the state through that. We had a whole range of issues. We had Labor's proposal for a mining tax. That would have gutted the state's revenue. We stopped that. We got on and built the infrastructure that this state needs and that we are all enjoying.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Fremantle! Member for Warnbro!

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** After the 2013 election, we came in with another wave of capital build. The Labor Party came in with Metronet—“Spaghetti-net”. That was the largest additional capital spend ever promoted by an opposition, with no real offsets. Good God! If the opposition had won that election, the state’s books would have been much worse. The opposition is trying to pretend that is not the case. Since the election, we have been hit with the largest withdrawal —

**Ms R. Saffioti** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for West Swan, there is plenty of time left. Listen to what the Treasurer has to say, and you can respond.

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** We have continued the capital spend, creating over 90 000 jobs. We have been criticised every inch of the way by people opposite. We have to interpret that as meaning that members opposite would not do it. They do want those jobs. They want no new schools and no new roads—nothing. Members opposite have to be accountable for what they say. Importantly, over the last three years, we have done the greatest degree of reform to expenditure in this state’s history. Expenditure growth was 2.4 per cent last year, and going lower. Members opposite have resisted every one of our reforms, which have reduced expenditure by \$25 billion. Every member opposite has stood in this place and complained and whinged and whined and said they would not do it—supporting their union mates. They have resisted every reform that we have put forward. The wannabe Treasurer, the member for Victoria Park, was asked how he was going to address the future, and he said, “I’m going to restrain growth.” However, he has resisted along the way every initiative that we have done. What are members opposite going to do? What they will do, if we read their little red book, is open the books and expenditure to the people who put them here—the union movement.

**Mr J.R. Quigley** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Butler!

**Dr M.D. NAHAN:** We have undertaken the greatest reforms to the public sector in this state’s history. Members opposite will wind them back.

**MS M.J. DAVIES (Central Wheatbelt — Minister for Water)** [11.27 am]: Mr Speaker —

**Mr R.F. Johnson** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Hillarys!

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

**Mr R.F. Johnson** interjected

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Hillarys, I have been pretty lenient with you. I call you to order for the first time.

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** What an absolutely ridiculous motion! The opposition has the gall to suggest that we have a collapsed cabinet and that we have not done anything for the last eight years. What a ridiculous motion! The opposition is grasping at straws.

**Mr M. McGowan** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Leader of the Opposition, I call you to order for the first time. I cannot hear a word that the minister is saying. Let us get this thing moving.

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** This state government —

**Ms M.M. Quirk** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Girrawheen, I call you to order for the second time.

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** This state government has shepherded this state through the biggest mining boom we have seen in the history of Western Australia.

**Mr D.J. Kelly** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Bassendean!

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** We have seen 500 000 people move to this state. That has required new housing, new water services, new transport, new health systems, new teachers and new schools. We do all this in an environment —

**Mr P. Papalia** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Warnbro, I call you to order for the first time.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** We do all this in an environment —

**Mr D.J. Kelly** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Bassendean, I call you to order for the first time. We are starting to bog badly.

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** We do all this in an environment in which we have a diminishing GST return. We have managed to pay and retain staff in an environment in which they were competing against an extraordinary movement in the mining sector. We have managed to do this in this environment. We have delivered significant outcomes for this state. I know where the revenue streams from members opposite will come from if they see themselves on this side. It will be goodbye royalties for regions.

Let me talk about the things that we have managed to do in alliance. Despite some of the differences that we have, we have managed to rebuild regional Western Australia and this state. We have seen the biggest upgrades to our health system in the history of regional Western Australia. We have seen new hospitals, doctors and nurses. We have support services such as the Royal Flying Doctor Service and aged-care services. We have invested in our schools and mobile phone towers. This state government has managed to do this. We have also managed to bring the entire state into the twenty-first century. We can look at the changes that we have seen in the Perth metropolitan areas. We have our differences. It is an alliance. The National Party reserves its right to have a policy position that at times differs from that of our partners in government. It makes government more robust. We are prepared to debate it. We will put those policies on the table. We have done that. We have seen that in public in the last two to three weeks. We are talking about a policy that we will continue to prosecute. We are entitled to continue to prosecute that. If members look at what we have done over the last eight years, they will see that when we have had differences in the past, we have managed to deliver outstanding outcomes for the people of Western Australia. We will stand very proudly on that record going to the next election. This is not a dysfunctional government. A dysfunctional government does not deliver the things that this state government has done in the last eight years. The Nationals do not resile from having a proposal to debate in public at the next election.

**Mr D.J. Kelly** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Bassendean!

**Ms M.J. DAVIES:** That is part of the alliance agreement that we absolutely understand. Members opposite do not understand it. We do not need to explain it to them. The punters out there absolutely understand what this state government has done.

We do not support this motion. We will stand very proud on the policy that we have been talking about. We absolutely reject what the member for Hillarys has been saying about taxes. It is not a tax; it is a fair charge. We are not talking about mums and dads and small businesses having to foot the bill for a flawed GST system. Those mining companies can afford to pay their fair share. That is exactly what we are talking about and we will prosecute that argument to the next election.

**MR B.S. WYATT (Victoria Park)** [11.32 am]: I look forward to hearing from the Deputy Premier. The last time I heard from her, she was comparing gross assets with net debt. I look forward to hearing from her —

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** The wall of noise. Member for North West Central, member for Wanneroo, I am not going to warn you again. I do not want to hear from you.

**Mr B.S. WYATT:** I enjoyed the speech of the Deputy Leader of the National Party. “Nothing wrong with us”, she said, with the eyes of the Minister for Regional Development boring into her back. Every single time the issues around the dysfunctional cabinet processes are raised, they say, “Oh, there’s nothing wrong. It’s all okay. We’re allowed to have our disagreements.” It goes all the way up to the loss of the AAA credit rating and all the way up to the \$4 billion operating deficit. The man who spent a lifetime critiquing that now says it is all okay.

**Ms M.J. Davies** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Minister, I call you for the first time.

**Mr B.S. WYATT:** Our revenue is not coming from a job-destroying policy of imposing a mining tax at the bottom of the cycle. What economic geniuses they are. What will the National Party do? It will hit the mining sector at the bottom of the cycle with a huge tax to destroy jobs. “That’s our plan”, says the National Party. The mob sitting in cabinet with the National Party says, “Oh, this is all okay because we can manage the balance sheet because we have two separate cabinets and it’s not madness.” That seems to be the response that they have got.

Let us reflect on the Minister for Transport’s public transport plan. It lasted about half an hour before the Minister for Transport, looking for the votes, said, “Well, we might actually do a station here or a station there.” Then the Treasurer, still smarting from the Violet Grove disagreement—we all remember that, Treasurer—said, “It may not

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

be there; it may be somewhere else.” Then my friend the Leader of the House got up to try to do the Colin Barnett critique of “who is captured by business the most?” I am a bit uncertain whether I am captured by business or the unions at the end of that, but we will work that through, will we not, John? I know we will get there.

I find it interesting that we get this from the government that from the very start contracted itself out to the business sector. Nowhere was that more apparent than last year when it said, “Do you know what, 500 Club; come on into the Premier’s office. Come on into the cabinet room and have your drinks. Come on in. You’re more than welcome to have your Christmas drinks up here because—let’s face the fact—you own a share of it.” That is what happened. We all remember that. I remember the government’s good friend Gerry Hanssen. I will remind members of Gerry Hanssen. Let me quote Mr Hanssen from 2012. Remember the leaders forum and a lazy \$25 000 for access? This is what Gerry Hanssen said it is all about —

“To influence the politicians, the best way is for key CEOs to sit down in front of them and read the riot act to them,” ...

Mr Hanssen said anyone who joined believing it was about lobbying would be “greatly mistaken” but agreed that policy could be shaped by the forum.

“It’s really to teach ministers how to conduct their affairs,” ...

The government that contracted itself out to the private sector years ago is now stunned that the private sector wants to knock off the leader. Are they surprised, because the private sector has a huge shareholding? Now the Minister for Transport seems to be conducting a hostile takeover of the Liberal Party party room. Mr Nalder is unable to compete. We have Mike Nahan, the deputy leader and Joe Francis all trying to bustle in the post-Barnett world. Who is going to get the numbers? Dean clearly cannot get them so he has gone to the National Party of all people! Honestly! If he brings these clowns in, he is in strife. He went to the National Party, saying, “Brendon Grylls will deliver it to me. He’ll get me there.” He was still uncertain, so he got a poll done. That is unbelievable. We all look at polls. We all know that. They come and they go but very rarely do we see a hostile takeover of the leadership of the Liberal Party by a particular minister supported by the private sector to which the government ceded control years ago. He comes in here with some WA Inc argument, saying, “We’re not subject to that, not like the Labor Party—owned by business, owned by the unions.” I do not know who owns us, John; I really do not. I am confused. The reality is, John, that at some point control will have to be taken. The Treasurer walked away from a lifetime of strong advocacy around tight spending commitments, the evils of an operating deficit and the evils of debt. We have a Treasurer who abandoned everything he once stood for and is now willing to spend whatever it takes to increase his own position.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Treasurer and member for Girrawheen, just relax. I appreciate your bonhomie, member for Victoria Park, calling the member for Kalamunda by his name, John, but I direct you to refer to him by his electorate.

**Mr B.S. WYATT:** I apologise, member for Kalamunda; I did not mean to disrespect you in any way by calling you by your first name.

I want to conclude with a couple of points. The Minister for Regional Development is a man whom I like. I think he was very accurate when he said, “The Premier is captured by big interests like Chevron.” That is what the Minister for Regional Development said when he was the Leader of the National Party. I remember that one of the very first acts the Treasurer did when he came into cabinet was run off and sign a public sector guarantee for private sector debt for Muja. We all remember that. I do not want to see any of the mob opposite coming in here saying, “We’re not captured by the private sector.” The private sector has owned them for four years.” Even its own mob in government knows that. Now they come in here and say, “We don’t need a plan because we’ve got the National Party out there selling one plan. We’ll just let them do it and pretend that all our commitments are going to be fully funded and fully costed.” The reality is, Treasurer, that the government has not had a coherent cabinet for years. Government members seem to think it is a joke and it is a credible way to run government. That is why the government lost the AAA credit rating. That is why the Treasurer is the seventh incarnation in that role. That is why spending is out of control. That is why the government is presiding over the biggest operating deficit in the history of Western Australia. That is why net debt is heading to \$40 billion. I want to hear the would-be Premier explain to me why it is okay to compare gross assets with net debt. Up you get!

**The SPEAKER:** Treasurer, you never stopped talking during that interlude. I call you to order for the first time.

*Point of Order*

**Mr J.M. FRANCIS:** Only my mother gets to call me Joey.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Butler, I call you to order for the first time.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** I am on my feet. If somebody wants to have a rest, carry on.

**Ms M.M. Quirk** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Girrawheen, I call you to order for the third time. Minister for Emergency Services, I gave you the call if you want to speak.

**Mr J.M. FRANCIS:** My point is that I think it is about time the opposition woke up and stopped calling members of this place by their first name. As I said, only my mum gets to call me by my first name.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** I gave you the call. That is your contribution. That is a point of order and that is finished now.

*Debate Resumed*

**The SPEAKER:** The question is that the motion be agreed to.

**MRS L.M. HARVEY (Scarborough — Deputy Premier)** [11.41 am]: This is typical of an opportunistic bunch of cowards who cannot even get up and make their case. Naturally, we are going to oppose this ridiculous interruption to the parliamentary process. What has happened here? We read in the Loan Bill, which everyone will get to debate the next time Parliaments sits. What did we interrupt for this motion? We interrupted the debate on legislation that will shut down the opportunity for drug traffickers to peddle methamphetamine across the state. That is what members opposite did so that they could make a cheap political point, which they failed to prosecute.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Mandurah, I call you for the third time; member for Swan Hills, I think it is the first time; and member for Cockburn, for the first time.

**Mrs L.M. HARVEY:** Let us look at what we have achieved as an apparently dysfunctional government, according to these people. This is a government led by a Premier who refused to give up on the projects which the community of Western Australia had been led to believe would be delivered and about which expectations had been raised of the delivery of. The Premier has delivered them. The stadium is coming out of the ground. We have rebuilt Perth city, with Elizabeth Quay, the Northbridge Link and the Perth underground bus station. We have the train going to Butler. We have extended Mitchell Freeway to Hester Avenue. We are building Roe 8 and the Forresterfield–Airport Link. We have rebuilt schools.

**Mr J.R. Quigley** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Thank you, member for Butler. I call you to order for the second time.

**Mrs L.M. HARVEY:** We have borrowed money to cope with unprecedented population growth in this state—growth that has been borne out of the economic management of this government ensuring that our businesses and industries can grow. People migrated here because they could get employment and they could see a future in Western Australia. We have grown our asset base by 55 per cent, or \$70 billion. It now sits at \$190 billion. We have rebuilt the education system and the health system. We have done that for those 450 000 people who say that Western Australia is the best place to live. This Liberal–National partnership has delivered the quality of life that people in Australia envy. That is what we have done. That is why we have borrowed money. In a couple of years when our GST fortunes reverse, there will not be a deficit. Why will our GST fortunes return? It will be because the Premier, Colin Barnett, has fought for a fair share of GST for this state.

**Mr P.B. Watson** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Albany!

**Ms M.M. Quirk** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** That was equally matched, so we will not talk about it.

**Mrs L.M. HARVEY:** The Premier has fought for eight years to get a fair deal for Western Australians from the GST and now the Prime Minister is saying, “I’m going to deliver that.” That is Colin Barnett’s achievement. Burswood stadium is Colin Barnett’s achievement, as are the Perth Children’s Hospital, Fiona Stanley Hospital, Roe 8 and the Forresterfield–Airport Link. We have also delivered an 84 per cent increase in funding to mental health services in this state. We have delivered a 117 per cent increase in disability services funding to those families in need looking after family members with disabilities in this state. That is what we have delivered and we are proud of it. We said that we would deliver 20 000 affordable homes by 2020. We did that by 2015, so we lifted the target.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**Mr P.B. Watson** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Albany, I call you to order for, I think, the first time.

**Mrs L.M. HARVEY:** We are now going to deliver 30 000 affordable homes by 2020, and we can do that because the Premier drives it and our ministers deliver it. We are proud of our record. We are proud of the fact that by the middle of 2017, we will have an additional 1 050 police and police auxiliary officers on the front line looking after the community of Western Australia and preserving community safety.

Every single individual on this side of the house knows that we have a cohesive government. We have ministers who get things done and we have a Premier with the drive and energy to keep pushing for improvements in Western Australia. Our partners, the National Party, stood by our side through minority government for those first four years. We have delivered significant reform. Our work is not done. In March 2017, the community will have a choice to recognise our work and our achievements or take a risk with the union puppeteers. The choice is clear.

**MS R. SAFFIOTI (West Swan)** [11.47 am]: I am glad the Liberal and National Parties are congratulating themselves on their performance, because I can tell them that the community is not congratulating them. This motion is about an economic and financial plan for the state, but we got a list of dot points —

**Mr F.A. Alban** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Swan Hills, you are becoming tiresome now. I call you to order for the second time.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** We got a dot point list written by the government media office and texted to the Deputy Premier before she got to her feet. That is all we got—a dot point list. Where is the economic and financial plan? You guys are a rabble.

**Mr V.A. Catania** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for North West Central, I call you to order now for the second time.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The Deputy Leader of the National Party is proud of the new mining tax that a cabinet colleague yesterday said would kill jobs in the state. They are in the same cabinet room and they have no coherent plan. They have led the state to the worst finances in the state's history.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Deputy Premier!

**Mrs L.M. Harvey:** It wasn't me.

**The SPEAKER:** Who was shouting out?

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Yes, she did.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Belmont, you are in the wrong seat.

A government member interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** I do not want to hear from anyone.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The government has led the state to the worst debt and the worst deficit in the state's history. It has no plan for jobs. Let us look at the main contenders. When asked about the 25 per cent unemployment in Mirrabooka–Balgas, the Minister for Training and Workforce Development showed that she does not care. She does not even know the figures. She is using her role in government to get soft media opportunities such as meeting with unsuspecting poor little apprentices around the state.

**Mrs L.M. Harvey** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** This time I have got you, Deputy Premier! I call you to order for the first time.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The Minister for Transport uses his transport plan not as a fully funded, fully costed coherent plan for the state but to buy favours in the leadership contest. That is what it is about—trying to buy the votes of the member for Morley and the member for Perth. That is what it is all about.

**Mr S.K. L'Estrange** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Churchlands!

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Then we have the Minister for Corrective Services.

**Ms E. Evangel** interjected.

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Perth, I call you to order for the first time. We have two minutes left.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The Minister for Corrective Services, who is purer than snow out there, takes directions from members of the business community on a weekly basis. Let us face it: the Treasurer is selling out all members opposite to fund his Roe 8. He does not care if he cannot fund projects in their electorates because it is all about him.

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Treasurer, I call you to order for the second time and member for Churchlands for, I think, the second time.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The Treasurer will sell out all members opposite because he cares only about his own seat. That is what happens in their cabinet. There is a complete breakdown of cabinet.

**Mr J. Norberger** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Joondalup, I call you to order for the first time.

**Mr D.J. Kelly** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Bassendean, for the second time!

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** There is a complete breakdown. The Minister for Transport has been buying votes with his transport plan and the Treasurer does not care about his colleagues; he cares only about his own seat. He will junk the state's finances and jeopardise the funding of any other project to get his project up. That is all he has ever cared about. The Minister for Health is handing out \$500 000 a month for an empty car park that taxpayers bought. Talk about relationships with business!

Several members interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for North West Central!

**Mr J.H.D. Day** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Leader of the House, I call you to order for the first time.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Members opposite have handed millions of dollars of taxpayers' money to companies for empty stadiums, empty hospitals and empty car parks. They should not lecture us about relationships with business. You guys have given millions of dollars to business. This is a dysfunctional, chaotic government that does not deserve to be here.

**Mr P.T. Miles** interjected.

**The SPEAKER:** Member for Wanneroo, I call you to order for the second time.

*Division*

Question put and a division taken with the following result —

**Extract from Hansard**  
[ASSEMBLY — Thursday, 25 August 2016]  
p5324b-5336a

Mr Mark McGowan; Mr John Day; Mr Rob Johnson; Ms Margaret Quirk; Dr Mike Nahan; Ms Mia Davies; Mr Ben Wyatt; Mr Joe Francis; Mrs Liza Harvey; Ms Rita Saffioti

---

Ayes (18)

Ms L.L. Baker  
Mr R.H. Cook  
Ms J.M. Freeman  
Mr R.F. Johnson  
Mr W.J. Johnston

Mr D.J. Kelly  
Mr F.M. Logan  
Mr M. McGowan  
Ms S.F. McGurk  
Mr M.P. Murray

Mr P. Papalia  
Ms M.M. Quirk  
Mrs M.H. Roberts  
Ms R. Saffioti  
Mr P.C. Tinley

Mr P.B. Watson  
Mr B.S. Wyatt  
Mr D.A. Templeman (*Teller*)

Noes (30)

Mr F.A. Alban  
Mr I.C. Blayney  
Mr I.M. Britza  
Mr G.M. Castrilli  
Mr V.A. Catania  
Mr M.J. Cowper  
Ms M.J. Davies  
Mr J.H.D. Day

Ms E. Evangel  
Mr J.M. Francis  
Mrs G.J. Godfrey  
Dr K.D. Hames  
Mrs L.M. Harvey  
Mr C.D. Hatton  
Mr A.P. Jacob  
Mr S.K. L'Estrange

Mr W.R. Marmion  
Mr J.E. McGrath  
Ms L. Mettam  
Mr P.T. Miles  
Ms A.R. Mitchell  
Mr N.W. Morton  
Dr M.D. Nahan  
Mr D.C. Nalder

Mr J. Norberger  
Mr D.T. Redman  
Mr A.J. Simpson  
Mr M.H. Taylor  
Mr T.K. Waldron  
Mr A. Krsticevic (*Teller*)

---

Pairs

Dr A.D. Buti  
Ms J. Farrer  
Mr J.R. Quigley  
Mr C.J. Tallentire

Ms W.M. Duncan  
Mr C.J. Barnett  
Dr G.G. Jacobs  
Mr P. Abetz

Question thus negatived.