

MINISTER FOR AGRICULTURE AND FOOD — GENETICALLY MODIFIED CROPS

7377. Mr P. Papalia to the Minister for Agriculture and Food

- (1) Will the Minister confirm on which occasions, during the period September 2008 to the present date, he or members of his staff have met with representatives of producers or suppliers of Genetically Modified (GM) crop seed including:
 - (a) the names of the producers or suppliers with whom the Minister or his staff met;
 - (b) in the case of staff members, the names and roles of the staff members who met with GM producers or suppliers;
 - (c) the dates and times of the meetings, and
 - (d) the purpose of the meetings?
- (2) Can the Minister confirm if the Department for Agriculture and Food, any employee of the Department, or any agency acting on behalf of the Department received any sponsorship, funding or gifts from any producers or suppliers of GM crop seed, if so, will the Minister list the source, amount/type and date of the sponsorship, funding or gift?
- (3) Can the Minister confirm whether he has received any donations, funding or gifts of any kind from any producer or supplier of GM crop seed, if so, will the Minister list the source, amount/type and date of the donation, funding or gift?
- (4) Can the Minister confirm if any of his staff have received any donations, funding or gifts of any kind from any producer or supplier of GM crop seed, if so, will the Minister list the name and position of the staff member and the source, amount/type and date of the donation, funding or gift?
- (5) Can the Minister confirm if any of his staff have been employed by, or acted as a lobbyist, consultant or salesperson for, any producer or supplier of GM crop seed, if so, will the Minister list the name and position of the staff member and the dates and nature of that activity?
- (6) Can the Minister confirm if, during the period September 2008 to the present, the Department for Agriculture and Food commissioned research into performance of GM crops, and if so, will the Minister provide the following information:
 - (a) the nature of the research;
 - (b) where and when the research took place;
 - (c) whether the research was funded jointly and, if so, what other party shared the cost, and if the findings of the research were published and released to the public, where and when did this occur?
- (7) Can the Minister confirm the following information in relation to Western Australian commercial honey production:
 - (a) what is the total annual value of sales of honey produced by Western Australian commercial honey producers;
 - (b) how much of this revenue is generated through sales to overseas markets; and
 - (c) what amount of revenue is generated by sales into each of these markets, and will the Minister list the markets?
- (8) Can the Minister confirm if the Department for Agriculture and Food has undertaken any studies, or if his Department is aware of any studies, into the annual value of bee pollination of arable, vegetable and fruit crops in Western Australia?
- (9) Can the Minister confirm if any non-Genetically Modified Intellectual Property owned by the Department for Agriculture and Food has been surrendered, sold or shared with any Genetically Modified crop producer or supplier, and if so, will the Minister list that material and the individuals or companies to whom the Intellectual Property has been given and the amount paid by the other party for the Intellectual Property rights?
- (10) Can the Minister list the number of occasions, during the period September 2008 to the present, that grain contamination occurred during transport from the farm gate to embarkation in ships in Western

- Australia, including the type of grains involved, the location, the volume of grain affected and the nature of the incident?
- (11) Can the Minister confirm the volume, expressed in tonnes and as a percentage of the overall WA canola crop, for each of the years 2008, 2009, 2010 and 2011, on the:
- (a) value in dollars of non-GM canola sold to the EU bio-fuel market;
 - (b) value in dollars of non-GM canola sold to any other market, and will the Minister list each market;
 - (c) value in dollars of GM canola sold to the EU bio-fuel market; and
 - (d) value in dollars of GM canola sold to any market, and will the Minister list each market?
- (12) Can the Minister confirm for each of the years 2008, 2009, 2010 and 2011 the volume and the value in dollars of Certified Organic and Certified Biodynamic canola sold to any market, and will the Minister list each market?
- (13) Can the Minister confirm the annual dollar value of all Western Australian Certified Organic, Certified Biodynamic, aquaculture and viticulture product sales?
- (14) Can the Minister confirm what, if any, efforts have been made by the Department for Agriculture and Food to identify and build processed sheep meat markets in the Middle East?
- (15) Can the Minister confirm what, if any, efforts have been made by the Department for Agriculture and Food to develop live cattle export markets outside of Indonesia?
- (16) Can the Minister confirm what, if any, efforts have been made by the Department for Agriculture and Food to develop processed cattle meat export markets?

Mr D.T. REDMAN replied:

Various parts of this question refer to “producers or suppliers of genetically modified (GM) crop seed”. The interpretation of what constitutes a producer or supplier of GM crop seed can be very broad. For the purposes of answering this question a producer or supplier of GM crop seed has been defined as companies that hold the patents to GM technology and companies that produce GM seed under licence, namely Monsanto, Syngenta, Pioneer Hi-Bred, Pacific Seeds, Nuseed, Cargill, Canola Breeders of WA, and Bayer Crop Science

- (1) The Minister or members of his staff have met with representatives of producers and suppliers of GM crop seed on six occasions.

Meeting 1:

- (a) Monsanto Australia Ltd
- (b) Minister Redman, Steve Thomas (policy adviser), Nicole Fernandes (policy adviser), Scott Mitchell (chief of staff).
- (c) 5 November 2008 at 2pm.
- (d) General briefing on GM canola.

Meeting 2:

- (a) Cargill Australia
- (b) Minister Redman, Nicole Fernandes (policy adviser), Scott Mitchell (chief of staff).
- (c) 28 January 2009 at 12:30pm.
- (d) The future of the Grain Licensing Authority in WA.

Meeting 3:

- (a) Bayer Crop Science
- (b) Minister Redman, Nicole Fernandes (policy adviser), Scott Mitchell (chief of staff).
- (c) 4 November 2009 at 9:30am.
- (d) General briefing on the development of GM technology.

Meeting 4:

- (a) Nuseed, Pacific Seeds, Canola Breeders Western Australia, Pioneer Hi-Bred.
- (b) Minister Redman, Julian Breheny (policy adviser).
- (c) 17 May 2010 at 5:15pm

(d) General discussion about grains industry.

Meeting 5:

- (a) Syngenta Asia-Pacific
- (b) Minister Redman, Scott Mitchell (chief of staff).
- (c) 24 February 2011 at 11:45am.
- (d) General briefing on the development of GM technology.

Meeting 6:

- (a) Monsanto Australia Ltd
 - (b) Minister Redman, Scott Mitchell (chief of staff), Jamie Henderson (policy adviser).
 - (c) 24 February 2011 at 3pm.
 - (d) General briefing on the development of GM technology.
- (2) [See paper 4715.] The attached table provides details of funds (grants and sponsorship) the Department of Agriculture of Food (DAFWA) has received from producers or suppliers of GM crop seed since 1996.
- (3) The Minister has not received any donations, funding or gifts from any producer or supplier of GM crop seed.
- (4) None of the Minister's staff have received any donations, funding or gifts from any producer or supplier of GM seed.
- (5) None of the Minister's staff have been employed by or acted as a consultant, lobbyist or salesperson for any producer or supplier of GM crop seed.
- (6) (a)–(c) Since September 2008 the Department of Agriculture and Food has contributed to trials designed to examine the performance of GM canola and GM cotton.

GM canola trials

- In 2010 and 2011, DAFWA carried out trials to examine the effect of nitrogen fertiliser on the yield of hybrid and open-pollinated triazine tolerant, Clearfield and Roundup Ready canola. In 2010, the trials were carried out at Gibson, Eradu, and Cunderdin, and in 2011, the trials were carried out at Gibson, Wittenoom Hills, Grass Patch, Cunderdin and Katanning. DAFWA, the Grains Research Development Corporation (GRDC) and CSIRO funded these trials.
- In 2010 and 2011, DAFWA carried out trials to examine the effect of sowing date on variability in canola phenology. In 2010 these trials were carried out at South Perth, Geraldton, Esperance, and Katanning and in 2011 the trials were carried out at Northam, Geraldton and Esperance. DAFWA, the GRDC and CSIRO funded these trials.
- In 2010 and 2011, DAFWA carried out trials to examine the effect of planting density on yield of hybrid and hybrid and open-pollinated triazine tolerant, Clearfield and Roundup Ready canola. In 2010 the trials were carried out at Gibson, Mingenew, Eradu, Katanning, Darkan and Cunderdin and in 2011 the trials were carried out at Gibson, Wittenoom Hills, Grass Patch, Cunderdin and Katanning. DAFWA, the GRDC and CSIRO funded these trials.

The results from these trials have been published as outlined below:

Defining economic optimum plant densities of open pollinated and hybrid canola in WA. 2011 Agribusiness Crop Updates, Western Australia. ISSN 1445-0593. p 213–216.

Defining economic optimum plant densities of open pollinated and hybrid canola in WA. 2011 Agribusiness Crop Updates, Green Range Western Australia.

Defining economic optimum plant densities of open pollinated and hybrid canola in WA. 2011 Agribusiness Crop Updates, Kojonup Western Australia.

Defining economic optimum plant densities of open pollinated and hybrid canola in WA. 2011 Agribusiness Crop Updates, Williams Western Australia.

Defining economic optimum plant densities of open pollinated and hybrid canola in WA. 2011 Agribusiness Crop Updates, Esperance Western Australia.

- In 2011, DAFWA evaluated the performance of dual-purpose canola and cereal crops grazed with cattle at Gibson. DAFWA, the GRDC and CSIRO funded these trials and the results of this research were published in:

Evaluation of dual purpose canola and cereals grazed with cattle. Grain and Graze Forum 26th Sept 2011.

Evaluation of dual purpose canola and cereals grazed with cattle. Crop Updates Workshop Feb 29 2012.

Evaluation of canola and cereals grazed with cattle. 2012 WA Agribusiness Crop Updates Proceedings. 28–29 February Feb 2012, Pan Pacific Hotel. ISSN 1445–0593. Pages 255–258.

- In 2010, DAFWA evaluated the performance of GM canola at the Frank Wise Institute of Tropical Agricultural Research at Kununurra. The results of this trial were provided to growers at the Research Institute field day in June 2010 and at the grower “wrap up” in December 2010.

GM cotton trials

Since September 2008 DAFWA has conducted research to evaluate the performance and management of GM cotton varieties. The trials were carried out during the dry season in 2008, 2009, 2010, and 2011 at the Frank Wise Institute of Tropical Agricultural Research at Kununurra. The research was funded by DAFWA and the Cotton Catchment Communities Cooperative Research Centre in 2008 and 2009. DAFWA funded the 2010 and 2011 research. The results of the research were reported to local farmers at annual grower meetings conducted by DAFWA.

- (7) (a) According to the Western Australia’s Agrifood, Fibre, Fisheries and Forestry Industries 2012 publication, in an average year the Western Australian apiculture industry produces about 2500 tonnes of honey with an estimated farm gate value of \$9 million.
- (b) In 2010/11, the total value of Western Australian honey exports was \$1 655 057.
- (c) [See paper 4715.]
- (8) In 1998, the Department of Agriculture and Food estimated that the annual value of bee pollination of arable, vegetable and fruit crops in Western Australia was \$89.05 million.
- (9) GM crop producers or suppliers in Western Australia include Monsanto, Pioneer Hi-Bred, Pacific Seeds, Nuseed, Cargill, Canola Breeders of WA, and Bayer Crop Science. The Department of Agriculture and Food has over 200 agreements involving non-genetically modified organisms with this group of organisations.
- (10) CBH Group Grain Receival Standards define a “contaminant” as: seeds of declared plants; Grain which is pickled, musty, or tainted with objectionable material including animal residues or excreta; Grain containing detectable residues of any organochlorine insecticides (eg. DDT, Lindane), mineral matter (eg. Dryacide) or organophosphates (eg. Malathion, Fenitrothion); or Overheated or unviable seed. I am not aware of any cases of contamination of grain during transport from farm gate to port.
- (11)–(12) The Australian Bureau of Agricultural and Resource Economics and Sciences (ABARES) reports on the quantity and value of canola exports but does not identify quantity and value of variety of the canola or the production system used to produce the canola.
- (13) The Department of Fisheries June 2011 report Estimated Western Australian Aquaculture production for 2009/10 estimated farm gate value of aquaculture production in WA (excluding marine algae and pearl oysters) was over \$10.6 million. The Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) reported that the value of WA wine exports in 2010–11 was \$34.6 million. The ABS and ABARES do not report on the annual value of Western Australian certified organic and certified biodynamic product sales.
- (14) The Department of Agriculture and Food (DAFWA) organised and operated an exhibition booth at Gulfood in Dubai in February 2012 to provide support to four Western Australian companies displaying their sheep meat products and meeting with existing and potential clients. DAFWA hosted a sheep meat specialist from Murdoch University at its trade booth and her interactions with visitors provided her with valuable insight into the future market challenges and opportunities from a production perspective.
- DAFWA frequently receives enquiries about chilled and frozen sheep meat from the Western Australian Trade Office in Dubai. All bona fide enquiries receive immediate attention by DAFWA staff

who respond to specific questions and provide general information on supply companies in Western Australia.

In 2011, WA exported 6937 tonnes of lamb and 6399 tonnes of mutton to the Middle East. The major markets in this region are UAE, Saudi Arabia and Jordan. Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) figures show WA sheep meat exports increased from \$190 million in 2009/10 to \$224 million in 2010/11.

- (15) DAFWA works with beef supply chain stakeholders including the WA Beef Council and Western Australia Live Exporters Association to identify and develop markets for live cattle. ABS figures show WA exported live cattle to 16 countries other than Indonesia in 2010–11. The total number of cattle exported to these 16 countries was 205 230 compared with 133 443 to Indonesia. The major markets outside Indonesia were Turkey, Israel, Saudi Arabia, Egypt, Pakistan and Jordan. The total value of the live cattle trade was \$245 million in 2010/11.
- (16) DAFWA works with the WA Beef Council and individual WA beef processors in developing export markets for beef. DAFWA hosted two processors at its Gulfood trade booth in Dubai in February 2012. These processors were seeking business opportunities to supply frozen and chilled beef products into the Middle East. WA has a comparative freight advantage in transit time by sea to the Middle East compared to the other Australian states.

DAFWA has worked with Meat and Livestock Australia in modelling market value for beef exports. The EU market has been identified as valuable through this process. To date no processor has responded to the opportunity identified. DAWA has also completed 2 pre-feasibility studies on a northern beef abattoir for WA.