

WESTERN AUSTRALIA

# LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

---

## VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 197

FIRST SESSION OF THE THIRTY-NINTH PARLIAMENT

---

THURSDAY, 24 MARCH 2016

### 1. Meeting of Assembly

The Assembly met at 9.00 a.m. pursuant to adjournment.

The Speaker took the Chair.

Prayers were read.

### 2. Petition

South Beach – Ms S. McGurk presented a petition from 634 persons asking the Legislative Assembly to ensure the preservation of South Beach and its natural surrounds for the people of Western Australia and to call on the State Government to resist further encroachment of development on or offshore from the South Beach coastline and request that a Groyne to Groyne Closed Waters Motorised Vessel area 200 metres from shore be gazetted (P. 356).

### 3. Papers

The following papers were presented and ordered to lie upon the Table of the House –

By the Clerk –

Central Institute of Technology – Annual Report 2015 (3992).

Challenger Institute of Technology – Annual Report 2015 (3993).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2351/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Margaret Dunnet for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4009).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2353/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Kevin Sparrow and Dianne Sparrow for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4021).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2354/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Rodney Graham for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4020).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2356/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and James John Timms and Joann Faye Timms for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4027).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2357/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and George Germantse, Bernice Ellen Germantse and Cicki Maree Rose and Paul Wilson Rose for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4033).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2360/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and John George Higgins and Margaret Janet Higgins for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4024).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2361/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Michael Cabassi for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4010).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2362/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Colin Campbell for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4011).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2363/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Alan Christie Russell and Denise Margaret Russell for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4030).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2364/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Brian Keith Hornby, Yvonne Lillian Hornby, Bryony Yvonne Kennedy and Derrise Maree Grbavac for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4032).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2366/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Noel Hartnett, Glen Hartnett, Peta Howell and Joanne Creasy for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4026).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2367/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Garth Wilson, Karen Maree Parke, Christine Ann Wilson Falco for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4018).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2368/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Peter Anderson for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4012).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2369/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Shirley Dempster for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4019).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2370/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and John Stewart Evans, Jean Margaret Evans, Joanne Marie Currian and David John Evans for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4031).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2372/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Doreen Roney, Shelley Violet Silverthorne, Kevin Malcolm Silverthorne, Kylie Michelle Silverthorne and Megan Chloe Silverthorne for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4025).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2374/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and James Franklin McAlinden, Donna Rochelle Jambanis, Nicole Marie Perera for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4022).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2377/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Ellen May Gray, Craig Gray, Tammy Armstrong, Matthew Armstrong and Denise Anne Rice for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4017).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2378/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Antony James Ryan for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4013).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2379/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Max Faulkner for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4014).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2382/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Cecilia Maria Prussian-Walmsley for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4028).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2383/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Lynne Robinson for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4015).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2384/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Allan Murdock for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4016).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2385/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and Bruce Guppy for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4029).

Conservation and Land Management Act 1984 – Lease No. 2393/100 between the Department of Parks and Wildlife and William Edmund Ridgeway Thompson, Sheryl Aileen Thompson, Daniel John Thompson, James Edmund Thompson, Alana Rebecca Thompson for an Existing Recreational Hut Located Along the Lower Reaches of the Donnelly River in the D’Entrecasteaux National Park (4023).

Curtin University – Annual Report 2015 (3994).

CY O’Connor Institute – Annual Report 2015 (3995).

Durack Institute of Technology – Annual Report 2015 (3996).

Edith Cowan University – Annual Report 2015 (3997).

Goldfields Institute of Technology – Annual Report 2015 (3998).

Great Southern Institute of Technology – Annual Report 2015 (3999).

Kimberley Training Institute – Annual Report 2015 (4000).

Murdoch University – Annual Report 2015 (4001).

Official Travel – Report of Overseas Air Travel Undertaken by Ministers, Parliamentary Secretaries and Government Officers on Official Business for the Three Months Ended 30 June 2015 (4002).

Official Travel – Report of Overseas Air Travel Undertaken by Ministers, Parliamentary Secretaries and Government Officers on Official Business for the Three Months Ended 30 September 2015 (4003).

Pilbara Institute – Annual Report 2015 (4004).

Polytechnic West – Annual Report 2015 (4005).

South West Institute of Technology – Annual Report 2015 (4006).

University of Western Australia – Annual Report 2015 (4007).

West Coast Institute – Annual Report 2015 (4008).

#### **4. Brief Ministerial Statements**

Brief Ministerial Statements were made by –

The Minister for Road Safety on the Government’s Easter Road Safety Campaign.

The Minister for Mines and Petroleum on the commencement of production of the Gorgon project.

The Minister for Environment on the Prince Regent National Park Survey in the Kimberley.

The Minister for Community Services with an update on financial counselling services.

## **5. Grievances**

The Acting Speaker called for grievances which were then made.

---

### *Paper*

The following paper was presented and ordered to lie upon the Table of the House –

By the Minister for Transport –

Transport, Minister for – Fremantle Sailing Club, Notice to Members (4034).

---

## **6. Community Development and Justice Standing Committee**

Ms M.M. Quirk, as Chair, presented the following report which was ordered to lie upon the Table of the House –

Community Development and Justice Standing Committee – How Do They Manage? An Investigation of the Measures WA Police has in Place to Evaluate Management of Personnel, Report No. 12 (4035).

Community Development and Justice Standing Committee – How Do They Manage? An Investigation of the Measures WA Police has in Place to Evaluate Management of Personnel, Report No. 12 – Submissions (4036).

Mr C.D. Hatton, Mr M.P. Murray, Ms L. Mettam and Dr A.D. Buti spoke on the report.

## **7. Suspension of Standing Orders**

Mr F.M. Logan, without notice, moved, That so much of the Standing Orders be suspended as is necessary to enable the following motion to be moved forthwith –

That this House calls on the Treasurer to launch an immediate financial audit into the Housing Authority's wasteful use of taxpayers' money and demand the Authority reverse the public housing rent hikes set to begin next week.

Debate ensued.

The Leader of the House moved, To add to the motion –

“

, subject to the debate being limited to 20 minutes for government members and 20 minutes for non-government members

”.

Amendment put and passed.

On the question, That the motion, as amended, be agreed to,

Question put.

The Speaker having counted the House, and an absolute majority being present and there being no dissentient voice, declared the motion, as amended, to be carried with the concurrence of an absolute majority of the whole number of members of the House.

## **8. Housing Authority**

Mr F.M. Logan, pursuant to the foregoing motion, moved,

That this House calls on the Treasurer to launch an immediate financial audit into the Housing Authority's wasteful use of taxpayers' money and demand the Authority reverse the public housing rent hikes set to begin next week.

Debate ensued.

Question put.

The Assembly divided.

#### Ayes (20)

Ms L.L. Baker	Mr F.M. Logan	Mrs M.H. Roberts
Dr A.D. Buti	Mr M. McGowan	Ms R. Saffioti
Mr R.H. Cook	Ms S.F. McGurk	Mr C.J. Tallentire
Ms J. Farrer	Mr M.P. Murray	Mr P.B. Watson
Ms J.M. Freeman	Mr P. Papalia	Mr B.S. Wyatt
Mr W.J. Johnston	Mr J.R. Quigley	Mr D.A. Templeman ( <i>Teller</i> )
Mr D.J. Kelly	Ms M.M. Quirk	

#### Noes (35)

Mr P. Abetz	Mr J.M. Francis	Mr P.T. Miles
Mr F.A. Alban	Mrs G.J. Godfrey	Ms A.R. Mitchell
Mr C.J. Barnett	Mr B.J. Grylls	Mr N.W. Morton
Mr I.C. Blayney	Dr K.D. Hames	Dr M.D. Nahan
Mr I.M. Britza	Mrs L.M. Harvey	Mr D.C. Nalder
Mr G.M. Castrilli	Mr C.D. Hatton	Mr J. Norberger
Mr V.A. Catania	Mr A.P. Jacob	Mr D.T. Redman
Mr M.J. Cowper	Dr G.G. Jacobs	Mr A.J. Simpson
Ms M.J. Davies	Mr S.K. L'Estrange	Mr M.H. Taylor
Mr J.H.D. Day	Mr W.R. Marmion	Mr T.K. Waldron
Ms W.M. Duncan	Mr J.E. McGrath	Mr A. Krsticevic ( <i>Teller</i> )
Ms E. Evangel	Ms L. Mettam	

Question thus negatived.

### 9. Suspension of Standing Orders

Mrs M.H. Roberts, without notice, moved, That so much of the Standing Orders be suspended as is necessary to enable the following motion to be moved forthwith –

That this House:

- (1) notes that the Minister for Police misled the House on 23 September 2015 when she advised the House:
 

“I categorically and emphatically state to the House and the community of Western Australia that no member of the Police Union has raised the issue of detective shortages with me at any time, until I contacted them yesterday ...”;

and
- (2) calls on the Minister for Police to apologise for misleading the House, immediately correct the record and, in accordance with Westminster traditions, resign her commission as a Minister in the WA Liberal Government.

Debate ensued.

The Leader of the House moved, To add to the motion –

“

, subject to the debate being limited to 10 minutes for government members and 10 minutes for non-government members

”

Amendment put and passed.

On the question, That the motion, as amended, be agreed to,

Question put.

The Speaker having counted the House, and an absolute majority being present and there being no dissentient voice, declared the motion, as amended, to be carried with the concurrence of an absolute majority of the whole number of members of the House.

# 10. Minister for Police

Mrs M.H. Roberts, pursuant to the foregoing motion, moved,

That this House:

- (1) notes that the Minister for Police misled the House on 23 September 2015 when she advised the House:  
“I categorically and emphatically state to the House and the community of Western Australia that no member of the Police Union has raised the issue of detective shortages with me at any time, until I contacted them yesterday ...”;  
and
- (2) calls on the Minister for Police to apologise for misleading the House, immediately correct the record and, in accordance with Westminster traditions, resign her commission as a Minister in the WA Liberal Government.

Debate ensued.

Question put.

The Assembly divided.

## Ayes (19)

Ms L.L. Baker	Mr F.M. Logan	Ms R. Saffioti
Dr A.D. Buti	Mr M. McGowan	Mr C.J. Tallentire
Mr R.H. Cook	Mr M.P. Murray	Mr P.B. Watson
Ms J. Farrer	Mr P. Papalia	Mr B.S. Wyatt
Ms J.M. Freeman	Mr J.R. Quigley	Mr D.A. Templeman ( <i>Teller</i> )
Mr W.J. Johnston	Ms M.M. Quirk	
Mr D.J. Kelly	Mrs M.H. Roberts	

## Noes (34)

Mr P. Abetz	Mrs G.J. Godfrey	Ms A.R. Mitchell
Mr F.A. Alban	Mr B.J. Grylls	Mr N.W. Morton
Mr C.J. Barnett	Dr K.D. Hames	Dr M.D. Nahan
Mr I.C. Blayney	Mrs L.M. Harvey	Mr D.C. Nalder
Mr I.M. Britza	Mr C.D. Hatton	Mr J. Norberger
Mr G.M. Castrilli	Mr A.P. Jacob	Mr D.T. Redman
Mr V.A. Catania	Dr G.G. Jacobs	Mr A.J. Simpson
Ms M.J. Davies	Mr S.K. L'Estrange	Mr M.H. Taylor
Mr J.H.D. Day	Mr W.R. Marmion	Mr T.K. Waldron
Ms W.M. Duncan	Mr J.E. McGrath	Mr A. Krsticevic ( <i>Teller</i> )
Ms E. Evangel	Ms L. Mettam	
Mr J.M. Francis	Mr P.T. Miles	

Question thus negatived.

# 11. Education and Health Standing Committee – Co-option of Member

The Leader of the House, pursuant to notice, moved,

That the Member for Kimberley be co-opted to participate in the Education and Health Standing Committee's inquiry into Aboriginal Youth Suicide.

Question put and passed.

**12. Variation to the Order of Business**

Ordered, That Bills Notice of Motion No. 1 be taken after Government Business Notice of Motion No. 1.

**13. Suspension of Standing Orders – Bell Group Companies (Finalisation of Matters and Distribution of Proceeds) Amendment Bill 2016**

The Leader of the House, pursuant to notice, moved,

That so much of Standing Orders be suspended as is necessary to enable the *Bell Group Companies (Finalisation of Matters and Distribution of Proceeds) Amendment Bill 2016* to proceed forthwith and to pass through all remaining stages without delay between the stages.

Debate ensued.

Question put and passed.

**14. Bell Group Companies (Finalisation of Matters and Distribution of Proceeds) Amendment Bill 2016**

The Treasurer, pursuant to notice, moved,

That a bill for “An Act to amend the *Bell Group Companies (Finalisation of Matters and Distribution of Proceeds) Act 2015*.” be introduced and read a first time.

Question put and passed.

The Treasurer presented an explanatory memorandum and bill read a first time.

The Treasurer moved, That the bill be now read a second time.

Debate ensued.

Debate interrupted by the Chair (Mr B.S. Wyatt speaking) and adjourned until a later stage of the sitting.

**15. Members’ Statements**

The Deputy Speaker called for members’ statements which were then made.

**16. Questions**

Questions without Notice were taken.

Questions on Notice Nos 5287 to 5313 were asked.

Questions on Notice Nos 5034, 5040, 5051, 5057, 5058, 5060 to 5069, 5071, 5073, 5075, 5079, 5092, 5095 to 5097, 5102, 5104, 5109, 5111, 5113, 5121, 5126, 5128, 5130 and 5133 to 5135 were answered.

---

Paper tabled by the Treasurer –

Question on Notice No. 5062 – Annual borrowings for each financial year from 2008–09 to 2014–15 for the Public Transport Authority, Western Power, Water Corporation, WA Health and Department of Education (4037).

Paper tabled by the Minister representing the Minister for Education –

Question on Notice No. 5096 – Details of spending by the Department of Education on support programs for the prenatal period and for children from birth to three years of age (4038).

---

**17. Variation to the Order of Business**

Ordered, That consideration of Government Business Order of the Day for the second reading of the *Bell Group Companies (Finalisation of Matters and Distribution of Proceeds) Amendment Bill 2016* be resumed.

**18. Bell Group Companies (Finalisation of Matters and Distribution of Proceeds) Amendment Bill 2016**

The Order of the Day for the resumption of the debate upon the second reading of the bill was read.

Debate resumed.

Question put and passed.

Bill read a second time.

*CONSIDERATION IN DETAIL*

Clauses 1 to 14 agreed to.

Title agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

The Treasurer moved, That the bill be now read a third time.

Question put and passed.

Bill read a third time and forwarded to the Legislative Council for concurrence.

**19. Special Adjournment**

The Leader of the House moved, That the House at its rising adjourn until Tuesday, 5 April 2016 at 2.00 p.m.

Question put and passed.

**20. Adjournment**

The Leader of the House moved, That the House do now adjourn.

Question put and passed.

The Assembly adjourned accordingly at 4.39 p.m. until Tuesday, 5 April 2016 at 2.00 p.m.

*Members present during any part of the day's proceedings* – All the members except Mr P.C. Tinley.

**KIRSTEN M. ROBINSON**  
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly

**HON. MICHAEL SUTHERLAND**  
Speaker of the Legislative Assembly