



Issue

There is a high level of support within the Carine community for redevelopment of the former Carine TAFE site, however the redevelopment proposal (**the Proposal**) put forward by LandCorp in partnership with Cedar Woods and St Ives (**the Developers**) is opposed on planning, social and environmental grounds.

Background

A Concept Plan for development of the TAFE site was first presented at a Community Open Day in August 2008. A survey of residents revealed a high level of support for all aspects of the Concept Plan, with the exception of multi-level apartments.

In February 2011, the Developers submitted a Local Structure Plan to the City of Stirling. The public consultation period concluded on 22 March 2011 and the Proposal is currently before the City of Stirling for consideration.

The Proposal

The Proposal provides for **421 new dwellings** plus commercial/retail premises on a 7.93 hectare parcel of land bordered by Marmion Avenue, Almadine Drive, Silica Road and Emerald Way, as outlined below.ⁱ



Precinct	Components	Height above natural ground level
A: Mixed Use	Existing: Child Care Centre (3,500m ²) New: Mixed Commercial (2,500m ²)	Single storey 2 storey
B: Retirement Village and Residential Aged Care	156 apartments across multiple buildings 120 high dependency residential aged care beds	4 – 8 storey 2 storey
C: R30/R60 single and group dwellings	35 group dwellings 33 single residences	2-3 storey 2-3 storey
D: R80 multi-storey apartments	70 apartments across two (2) buildings	8 storey

Community concerns with regard to the Proposal

1. Community consultation has been inadequate and the Proposal fails to address community concerns.

A Stakeholder Reference Group (SRG), established in August 2008 to facilitate community input, met on only four occasions, with two of these ‘meetings’ comprising site visits. SRG members have consistently argued for a development that preserves (a) the character and amenity of the existing neighbourhood and (b) preserves the environmental value of the land. The Proposal unequivocally fails to meet these community objectives.

The Developers announced their intention to hold a second Community Open Day to enable residents to provide feedback on a more detailed Structure Plan, which would then inform preparation of the Proposal for submission to the City of Stirling.ⁱⁱ The second Community Open Day did not occur, depriving the community of any meaningful input into the Proposal.

2. The Proposal provides for a large scale, high rise development, including six apartment buildings of 4-8 storeys in height, which is fundamentally at odds with the character of Carine’s existing built environment.

Ninety percent of existing Carine dwellings are separate houses, the remainder being predominantly duplexes (10 percent) and just four being classified as flats/apartments.ⁱⁱⁱ The majority of existing dwellings are single storey and maximum building height is currently two residential levels. By stark contrast, 77 percent of dwellings in the proposed development will be located in 4-8 storey apartment blocks, four within close proximity of verges on Silica Road and Almadine Drive.

3. The Proposal provides for a dwelling density that is 10 times the existing dwelling density across Carine.

The 2006 Census recorded 2,267 dwellings in Carine, which equates to a dwelling density of 4.8 dwellings per gross hectare (dwellings/GH).^{iv} The Proposal will yield a dwelling density of 56.5 dwellings/GH across Precincts B-D inclusive of Residential Aged Care (RAC) units, or 48.7 dwellings/GH excluding the RAC facility.^v

4. The Proposal provides for a dwelling density that is 2-3 times the Western Australian Planning Commission’s desirable dwelling density for a site with a low activity profile.

Directions 2031^{vi} identifies a network of Activity Centres (ACs) as the core focus of urban growth in Western Australia over the next 20-25 years. The Proposal includes a commercial precinct that equates to a Local AC (the 7th and lowest tier on the AC Hierarchy). Two existing commercial lots opposite the TAFE site are also designated Local ACs.

State Planning Policy 4.2^{vii} establishes dwelling density targets within walkable catchment for each tier in the AC hierarchy (shown below). Extrapolating from this table, a density of 15-25 dwellings/GH or less would be appropriate for the TAFE site.

Typical characteristics	Perth Capital City	Strategic metropolitan centres		Secondary centres		District centres		Neighbourhood centres	
		Minimum	Desirable	Minimum	Desirable	Minimum	Desirable	Minimum	Desirable
Walkable Catchment for residential density target	N/A	800m		400m		400m		200m	
Residential density target per gross hectare ⁸	N/A	30	45	25	35	20	30	15	25

ENDNOTES

- i LandCorp partnering Cedar Woods Properties Limited and St Ives Group, *Carine Vision Local Structure Plan, Public Consultation*, February 2011.
- ii Carine Vision Bulletin 2, available at <http://carinevision.com.au/assets/files/carine%20vision%20bulletin%202.pdf>, accessed on 10 May 2011.
- iii Australian Bureau of Statistics, *2006 Census of Population and Housing*, available at <http://www.abs.gov.au/websitedbs/d3310114.nsf/home/census+data>, accessed on 10 May 2011.
- iv *Ibid.*
- v Estimate based on 294 dwellings plus 120 residential aged care beds (total 414 dwellings) across 7.32 hectares (total site area, 7.93 hectares, minus land area of Precinct A, 0.61 hectares). When RAC facility (1.28 hectares) is excluded from calculation, estimated dwelling density is 48.7 dwellings per gross hectare.
- vi Government of Western Australia, Western Australian Planning Commission, *Directions 2031 and Beyond*, available at <http://www.planning.wa.gov.au/Plans+and+policies/Publications/2224.aspx>, accessed on 10 May 2011.
- vii Government of Western Australia, Western Australian Planning Commission, *State Planning Policy 4.2 Activity Centres for Perth and Peel*, accessed on 10 May 2011.
- viii Motor vehicle estimates derived from estimated average 1.6 car bays per apartment/group dwelling and 2.0 car bays per single residence. Estimate does not include worker vehicles (70 bays allocated to RAC), or vehicles using commercial facilities.
- ix Australian Bureau of Statistics, *2006 Census of Population and Housing*, available at <http://www.abs.gov.au/websitedbs/d3310114.nsf/home/census+data>, accessed on 10 May 2011.
- x Australian Bureau of Statistics, *Housing Occupancy and Costs, 2007-08*, available at <http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/4130.0>, accessed on 10 May 2011.
- xi Coffey Environments, *Spring Flora and Vegetation Assessment Carine TAFE site*, April 2008.
- xii Coffey Environments, *Level 1 Fauna Assessment Carine TAFE site*, August 2008.