WESTERN AUSTRALIA

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

No. 122

TUESDAY, 20 MARCH 2007

1. Meeting of Council

The Council assembled at 3.30pm pursuant to order.

The President, Hon Nick Griffiths, took the Chair and read prayers.

2. Messages from His Excellency the Governor - Assent to Bills

The President reported the receipt of Messages from His Excellency the Governor assenting to the following Bills -

8 December 2006 - Message No. 62	Act No.
Electoral Legislation Amendment Bill 2006	64 of 2006
Prisons and Sentencing Legislation Amendment Bill 2006	65 of 2006
Local Government Amendment Bill 2006	66 of 2006
11 December 2006 - Message No. 63	Act No.
Stamp Amendment Bill 2006	67 of 2006
Industrial Training Amendment Bill 2006	68 of 2006
13 December 2006 - Message No. 64	Act No.
Consumer Protection Legislation Amendment and Repeal Bill 2005	69 of 2006
Betting and Racing Legislation Amendment Bill 2006	70 of 2006
Shipping and Pilotage Amendment Bill 2006	71 of 2006
Railway Discontinuance Bill (No. 2) 2006	72 of 2006
Liquor and Gaming Legislation Amendment Bill 2006	73 of 2006
20 December 2006 - Message No. 65	Act No.
Water Efficiency Labelling and Standards Bill 2006	74 of 2006
21 December 2006 - Message No. 66	Act No.
Auditor General Bill 2006	75 of 2006
Financial Management Bill 2006	76 of 2006
Financial Legislation Amendment and Repeal Bill 2006	77 of 2006

3. Statement by President - Business of the House - Standing Orders

The President made the following Statement -

Honourable Members, before I commence the activities of the House, I remind Members that we now operate under the standing orders as the last sessional orders adopted by resolution of this House on 23 March 2006 expired on 31 December 2006.

4. Statement by President - Legislative Council - 175th Anniversary

The President made the following Statement -

Honourable Members, this year is the 175th anniversary of the first sitting of the Legislative Council on 7 February 1832. To acknowledge this historic occasion, events are planned for 2007, including foyer displays, a student Parliament with a Legislative Council focus and a dedicated webpage. Members would have received a booklet entitled *The Legislative Council Celebrates 175 Years*. The Parliamentary Education Office, Parliamentary Library and information technology department are involved with this project as part of their usual excellent services to the Legislative Council.

Projects are also occurring under the auspices of the Parliamentary History Advisory Committee and the Australasian Study of Parliament Group Western Australian Chapter that have particular relevance to the anniversary. I refer specifically to the Legislative Council minutes project, being the transcription of the handwritten minutes of the Legislative Council from 1832 to 1870 and, on 7 June 2007, a discussion on the effectiveness of the Legislative Council in reviewing actions of the executive. I look forward to commemorating the anniversary with Members throughout the year.

5. Statement by President - Chamber Works

The President made the following Statement -

Honourable Members may have noticed that some chamber works have occurred over the summer recess. In addition to repairs to some armrests and the stained glass windows and glass, two display boards have been erected on either side of the entrance to the Legislative Council antechamber. One board displays the Members and officers of the Legislative Council for the thirty-seventh Parliament. This re-establishes the practice of having Members' seating and photos for each Parliament commemorated in this manner. The other display is in recognition of this year being the 175th anniversary of the first sitting of the Legislative Council. It lists all Members from 1832 to 2007.

6. Statement by President - Corruption and Crime Commission - Privileges of the House

The President made the following Statement -

Honourable Members, I advise the House of some events that have occurred during the past few weeks relating to the activities of the Corruption and Crime Commission. In advising the House I note that, as President, I am charged with upholding the rules, customs and dignity of the House, including the protection of the rights and privileges of the House. Over the past few weeks the Legislative Council has been working cooperatively with the commission to ensure that both the privileges of the House are maintained and that the operations of the commission are not interrupted as a result of any doubt about the applicable law. Members will note that on 8 March 2007, I, together with the Speaker, communicated directly with Members on the matter of parliamentary privilege and recent hearings of the commission.

Parliamentary privilege refers to two significant aspects of the law relating to Parliament - the privileges or immunities of the Houses of the Parliament and the powers of the Houses to protect the integrity of their processes, particularly the power to punish contempts. Parliamentary privilege provides certain immunities to the Houses of Parliament to ensure that the Parliament operates independently and free from interference from the organs of the executive.

These immunities and powers are very extensive, but they carry with them great responsibilities. They are deeply ingrained in the history of free institutions, which could not have survived without them.

Parliamentary privilege emerged as the result of the struggle between the Crown, the courts and the House of Commons in the United Kingdom over hundreds of years. There were many flashpoints. One crucial flashpoint occurred in the second half of the seventeenth century and related principally to one of the major privileges of Parliament - the right to freedom of speech in the Parliament. As a result of the conflict between Parliament and James II, the Parliament issued the Bill of Rights in 1689. Article 9 of the Bill provides -

That the freedom of speech, and debates or proceedings in parliament, ought not to be impeached or questioned in any court or place out of parliament.

Article 9 forms part of the law of Western Australia through the *Parliamentary Privileges Act 1891*, which confers on the Legislative Council and the Legislative Assembly the privileges, immunities and powers of the House of Commons of the United Kingdom as at 1 January 1989.

Using the words of the *Bill of Rights*, it is a fundamental privilege of the Commons, and therefore of this House, that "proceedings in Parliament ought not to be impeached or questioned in any court or place out of the Parliament". It ensures that Members may speak freely without fear of the consequences. This is a necessary parliamentary protection in a democratic society. This freedom is also of significance to others who have dealings with Parliament; for example, the freedom also applies to witnesses before parliamentary committees.

In section 16(3) of the commonwealth *Parliamentary Privileges Act 1987*, the federal Parliament has provided a declaration of the law in this area. Section 16(3) provides -

In proceedings in any court or tribunal, it is not lawful for evidence to be tendered or received, questions asked or statements, submissions or comments made, concerning proceedings in Parliament, by way of, or for the purpose of:

- (a) questioning or relying on the truth, motive, intention or good faith of anything forming part of those proceedings in Parliament;
- (b) otherwise questioning or establishing the credibility, motive, intention or good faith of any person; or
- (c) drawing, or inviting the drawing of, inferences or conclusions wholly or partly from anything forming part of those proceedings in Parliament.

In 1995 the Privy Council in *Prebble v TVNZ* (1995 Appeal Cases at page 1) endorsed section 16(3) as a fair and accurate statement of the common law position on parliamentary privilege in relation to proceedings in a court or tribunal.

Both Parliament and the commission are bound by the law. Indeed, section 3(2) of the *Corruption and Crime Commission Act* provides -

Nothing in this Act affects, or is intended to affect, the operation of the *Parliamentary Privileges Act 1891* or the *Parliamentary Papers Act 1891* and a power, right or function conferred under this Act is not to be exercised if, or to the extent, that the exercise would relate to a matter determinable exclusively by a House of Parliament, unless that House so resolves.

In this context I advise the House of some matters.

1. Section 27A of the *Corruption and Crime Commission Act 2003*: On 18 January 2007 I received a letter from the Commissioner of the Corruption and Crime Commission dated 15 January 2007 seeking to refer a matter to me as Presiding Officer pursuant to section 27A of the *Corruption and Crime Commission Act 2003*. The matter related to misconduct allegations against unnamed Ministers influencing chief executive officers about second-tier

employment decisions. Further correspondence took place. I will apprise the Procedure and Privileges Committee of the matters.

2. Request by the CCC for access to records, Members and officers: On 12 March 2007 I received a letter from the commissioner requesting access to committee records, committee Members and committee staff for the purpose of the commission's investigations in relation to a proposed inquiry by the Legislative Council's Standing Committee on Estimates and Financial Operations.

For the consideration of the House I table the letter to me dated 12 March 2007 from the commission and my letter dated 13 March 2007 to the commission. (Tabled paper 2380).

I reiterate that, as President, I am charged with upholding the rules, customs and dignity of the House, including the protection of the rights and privileges of the House. I also reiterate that both Parliament and the commission are bound by the law.

Parliament, in anticipation of these types of investigations, enacted the *Corruption and Crime Commission Act 2003* and included specific procedures in section 27A and 27B to enable certain investigations to be undertaken. The process enables the commission to refer allegations to the relevant Presiding Officer to be dealt with by a committee of the House whose functions include considering matters relating to the practice, procedure and privileges of the House. In referring any allegations, the commission must, first, name the Member or officer concerned; secondly, state the grounds on which the allegation is made; and, thirdly, state the nature of misconduct by reference to a particular provision of the Act. If a referral has been made in accordance with those terms, the Presiding Officer must refer the matter to the privileges committee. If the privileges committee resolves to carry out its own inquiry, it must do so by directing the commission to conduct the inquiry on behalf of the House. The commission, as an agent of the Parliament, is then provided all the parliamentary privileges to conduct its investigations and must act in conformity with the *Parliamentary Privileges Act*.

Section 27A(5) further provides that nothing prevents a Member or officer who is subject to a referral from being charged with an offence, whether or not the charge relates to the matters that form the basis of the allegation; that is, allegations involving criminal matters would, of course, be referred to prosecuting authorities.

As stated, over the past few weeks the Legislative Council has been working cooperatively with the commission to ensure that both the privileges of the House are maintained and that the operations of the commission are not interrupted as a result of any doubt about the applicable law.

Ordered - That consideration of the President's Statement be made an Order of the Day for the next sitting.

7. Statement by President - Hon Shelley Archer - Resignation from Parliamentary Committees

The President made the following Statement -

I have received a letter from Hon Shelley Archer, which states -

Dear President

Please accept my resignations as Member of the Joint Standing Committee on Delegated Legislation and the Standing Committee on Estimates and Financial Operations.

I take this opportunity to thank the committee staff for their exemplary service and the ongoing goodwill they display towards all Members.

Yours sincerely

Hon Shelley Archer, MLC.

8. Standing Committee on Estimates and Financial Operations - Special Report on a Matter of Privilege

Hon Giz Watson presented the Report of the Standing Committee on Estimates and Financial Operations in relation to the Special Report on a Matter of Privilege. (Tabled paper 2386).

Hon Giz Watson moved, That the Report do lie upon the Table and be printed.

Question - put and passed.

9. Select Committee of Privilege - Establishment

Hon Giz Watson moved, without notice, pursuant to SO155 -

That -

A Select Committee of Privilege be appointed to inquire into and report on -

- (a) whether there has been any disclosure of deliberations of the Standing Committee on Estimates and Financial Operations relating to a proposed inquiry into the State's Iron Ore industry;
- (b) if so, whether such disclosure constitutes a breach of the privileges, or is a contempt, of this House; and
- (c) if the Committee so finds, what penalty, if any, the House might impose for the breach or contempt.
- (2) The Committee have access to documents in the possession or under the control of the Standing Committee on Estimates and Financial Operations relevant to the inquiry.
- (3) The Committee, and the proceedings of the Committee, are subject to Chapter XXII of Standing Orders and it is to be regarded for all purposes as a committee appointed under that Chapter.
- (4) The Committee have power to meet at any time when the Legislative Council is not sitting or a sitting is suspended.
- (5) The Committee may present interim reports without a requirement for leave and is to present its final report to the House not later than Wednesday, 30 May 2007.

Debate adjourned pursuant to SO 155.

10. Distinguished Visitors

The President drew attention to the presence in the gallery of the President of the Legislative Council of the Parliament of Victoria, Hon Bob Smith, and the Clerk of the Legislative Council of the Parliament of Victoria, Mr Wayne Tunnecliffe, and, on behalf of Honourable Members, extended a warm welcome to them.

11. Petitions

Hon Giz Watson presented a petition from 602 residents of Western Australia requesting the Legislative Council oppose urban development by LandCorp of pristine coastal land at Lots 1512 and 1523 Emu Point Drive, Albany. (Tabled paper 2381).

Hon Giz Watson presented a petition from 268 residents of Western Australia requesting the Legislative Council consider concerns against the installation of the proposed high voltage transmission lines from Muja to Wellstead. (Tabled paper 2382).

Hon Giz Watson presented a petition from 156 residents of Western Australia requesting the Legislative Council legislate to declare 26 May a public holiday throughout Western Australia. (Tabled paper 2383).

Hon Barry House presented a petition from 10 758 residents of Western Australia requesting the Legislative Council urgently amend the *Daylight Saving Act 2006*. (Tabled paper 2384).

Hon Simon O'Brien presented a petition from 405 residents of Western Australia requesting the Legislative Council oppose the proposal for the Water Corporation to draw 45 gigalitres of water from the Yarragadee Aquifer. (Tabled paper 2385).

Hon Ray Halligan sought leave of the House to present a non-conforming petition. Leave denied.

12. Ministerial Statement - Child Protection - Community Round Table

The Minister for Child Protection made a Ministerial Statement with respect to hosting the two-day ministerial community round table on child protection.

Ordered - That consideration of the Ministerial Statement be made an Order of the Day for the next sitting.

13. Papers

The following Papers were laid on the Table by -

President

110010011
Auditor General's Papers -
Performance Examination Having Your Say - Public Participation in Government Decision-Making (Report No. 1) (28 February 2007) (Deemed tabled 28/02/2007) 2346
Reports -
Corruption and Crime Commission - Eligibility for Government Housing: A report on a corruption prevention review of the Government Employees' Housing Authority (23 February 2007) (Deemed tabled 23/02/2007)
Corruption and Crime Commission - Misconduct Handling Procedures in the Western Australian Public Sector: Department for Community Development (05 February 2007) (Deemed tabled 05/02/2007)
Inspector of Custodial Services - Report of an Inspection of Wooroloo Prison Farm (Report No. 39) (January 2007) (Date received 29/01/2007)
Inspector of Custodial Services - Report of an Inspection of Regional Court Security and Custodial Services (CSCS) (Report No. 40) (February 2007) (Date received 15/02/2007)
Public Sector Standards Commissioner, Office of the [OPSSC] - Annual Compliance Report (2005-2006) (March 2007)
Public Sector Standards Commissioner, Office of the [OPSSC] - Compliance Report, Public Interest Disclosure (2005-2006) (March 2007)
Leader of the House
Addendums -
Amendment to Workcover Western Australia Annual Report (2005-2006)
Agreements -
Contract for the Provision of Court Security and Custodial Services - Variation Agreement between the State and Australian Integration Management Services Corporations Pty Ltd
Enter into an Agreement valued over \$1 million, with Industrial Road Pavers Pty Ltd 2355
Poseidon Nickel Agreement 1971 - Variation Agreement between the State and Niagara Mining Limited (22/01/2007)

Annual Reports -	
Australian Crime Commission (2005-2006) (Date received 02/01/2007)	. 2357
Co-operative Bulk Handling Limited [CBH] (2005-2006) (Date received 08/03/2007)	. 2358
Dental Board (2005-2006) (Date received 16/01/2007)	. 2359
Legal Practice Board (2005-2006) (Date received 16/01/2007)	. 2360
Legal Practitioners Complaints Committee (2005-2006) (Date received 16/01/2007)	. 2361
Local Health Authority Analytical Committee (2005-2006) (12/12/2006)	. 2362
National Transport Commission (2005-2006) (Date received 16 /01/2007)	. 2363
Nurses Board (2005-2006) (Date received 16/01/2007)	. 2364
Perry Lakes Redevelopment (2005-2006) (Date Received 20/03/2007)	. 2365
State of the Fisheries Report (2005-2006) (Date received 12/12/2006)	. 2366
Directions -	
Planning and Development Act 2005 - Ministerial Direction to Western Australian Planning Commission regarding Smiths Beach Location 413	. 2367
Leases -	
CALM Lease No. 1316/97 - Between CALM and Department of Defence - Coolilup Rifle Range, Part of State Forrest 12	. 2368
CALM Lease No. 2240/97 - Between CALM and Water Corporation - Gnangara Road Booster Pump Station, State Forest 65	
Ministerial Approvals -	
East Perth Redevelopment Act 1991 - Sale of Lots 406 and 407 Newcastle Street, Northbridge	. 2370
Midland Redevelopment Act 1999 - To enter into a Contract with Clinton Long Project Management for works being the Block 1, Block 3 and Pattern Shop	. 2371
Plans -	
Energy Safety Business Plan 2007/2008 (Dated 12/01/2007)	. 2372
Reports -	
National Health and Medical Research Council [NHMRC], Embryo Research Licensing Committee - Report to the Parliament of Australia (for the period 01 April 2006 to 30 September 2006)	. 2373
State Supply Commission - Investigation into Department of Corrective Services Supplementary Information No. B40 (25 October 2006) (Date received 19/12/2006)	. 2374
Treasury Corporation Quarterly Report for the quarter ended 31 December 2006	. 2375
Response to Reports -	
Audit Considerations in the Public Accounts Committee Report Number 4 - Local Government Accountability in Western Australia - December 2006 (Minister for Local Government)	. 2376
Select Committee on the Adequacy of Foster Care Assessment Procedures by the Department for Community Development (Minister for Child Protection)	
Standing Committee on Environment and Public Affairs - In relation to a Petition into the Proposed Marina at Point Peron (Minister for Land Information)	. 2378

14. Corruption and Crime Commission - Western Australian Government - Suspension of Standing Orders

Hon Norman Moore moved, without notice -

That so much of Standing Orders be suspended as would enable me to move the following motion, to enable the motion to be debated and if not resolved before 10.00pm the question shall then be put.

That this House expresses its grave concern at the significant deterioration in the governance and administration of the State of Western Australia resulting from a Government preoccupied with continued internal division and conflict, manipulated by outside influences and increasingly demonstrating serious signs of disfunctionality, and calls on the Government to urgently address the issues raised by the Corruption and Crime Commission and refocus its attention on restoring public confidence in the capacity of the Government to govern for all Western Australians without fear or favour.

Debate ensued.

The Leader of the House moved to amend the motion as follows -

To delete the following words -

"and if not resolved before 10.00pm the question shall then be put."

Debate ensued.

Amendment - put.

The House divided.

Ayes (15)

Hon Shelley Archer	Hon Graham Giffard
Hon Matt Benson-Lidholm	Hon Sheila Mills
Hon Vincent Catania	Hon Louise Pratt
Hon Kim Chance	Hon Ljiljanna Ravlich
Hon Kate Doust	Hon Sally Talbot
Hon Sue Ellery	Hon Ken Travers
Hon Adele Farina	Hon Ed Dermer (Teller)
II I D 1	

Hon Jon Ford

Noes (17)

Hon Ken Baston	Hon Paul Llewellyn
Hon George Cash	Hon Robyn McSweeney
Hon Peter Collier	Hon Norman Moore
Hon Murray Criddle	Hon Helen Morton
Hon Donna Faragher	Hon Simon O'Brien
Hon Anthony Fels	Hon Barbara Scott
Hon Nigel Hallett	Hon Giz Watson

Hon Ray Halligan Hon Bruce Donaldson (Teller)

Hon Barry House

Amendment thus negatived.

Question, That Standing Orders be suspended - put.

There being a dissentient voice the President ordered the House to divide.

Ayes (17)

Hon Ken Baston
Hon Paul Llewellyn
Hon George Cash
Hon Robyn McSweeney
Hon Peter Collier
Hon Norman Moore
Hon Murray Criddle
Hon Helen Morton
Hon Donna Faragher
Hon Anthony Fels
Hon Barbara Scott
Hon Nigel Hallett
Hon Giz Watson

Hon Ray Halligan Hon Bruce Donaldson (Teller)

Hon Barry House

Noes (15)

Hon Shelley Archer
Hon Matt Benson-Lidholm
Hon Sheila Mills
Hon Vincent Catania
Hon Louise Pratt
Hon Kim Chance
Hon Ljiljanna Ravlich
Hon Sally Talbot
Hon Sue Ellery
Hon Adele Farina
Hon Ed Dermer (Teller)

Hon Jon Ford

The concurrence of an absolute majority of the whole number of Members not being met Standing Orders not suspended.

15. Leave of Absence - Hon Margaret Rowe

Hon Bruce Donaldson, by leave, moved without notice -

That leave of absence be granted to Hon Margaret Rowe for three sitting days due to ill health. Question - put and passed.

16. Liquor and Gaming Legislation Amendment Bill 2006

The following Message from the Legislative Assembly was reported -

Mr President Message No. 208

The Legislative Assembly acquaints the Legislative Council that it has agreed to the amendments made by the Legislative Council in the *Liquor and Gaming Legislation Amendment Bill 2006*.

Dr S.C. Thomas Acting Speaker

Legislative Assembly Chamber

Perth, 12 December 2006

17. Water Efficiency Labelling and Standards Bill 2006

The following Message from the Legislative Assembly was reported -

Mr President Message No. 209

The Legislative Assembly acquaints the Legislative Council that it has agreed to the amendments made by the Legislative Council in the *Water Efficiency Labelling and Standards Bill* 2006.

Dr S.C. Thomas Acting Speaker

Legislative Assembly Chamber

Perth, 12 December 2006

18. Auditor General Bill 2006

The following Message from the Legislative Assembly was reported -

Mr President Message No. 210

The Legislative Assembly acquaints the Legislative Council that it has agreed to the amendments made by the Legislative Council in the *Auditor General Bill 2006*.

Mr P.B. Watson

Acting Speaker

Legislative Assembly Chamber

Perth, 12 December 2006

19. Financial Management Bill 2006

The following Message from the Legislative Assembly was reported -

Mr President Message No. 211

The Legislative Assembly acquaints the Legislative Council that it has agreed to the amendments made by the Legislative Council in the *Financial Management Bill 2006*.

Mr P.B. Watson

Acting Speaker

Legislative Assembly Chamber

Perth, 12 December 2006

20. Financial Legislation Amendment and Repeal Bill 2006

The following Message from the Legislative Assembly was reported -

Mr President Message No. 212

The Legislative Assembly acquaints the Legislative Council that it has agreed to the amendments made by the Legislative Council in the *Financial Legislation Amendment and Repeal Bill 2006*.

Mr P.B. Watson

Acting Speaker

Legislative Assembly Chamber

Perth, 12 December 2006

21. Shire of Nannup Health Amendment Local Laws 2006 - Disallowance - Discharge from Notice Paper

Hon Ray Halligan, by leave, moved without notice -

That Order of the Day No. 358, *Shire of Nannup Health Amendment Local Laws* 2006 - Disallowance, be discharged from the Notice Paper.

Question - put and passed.

22. Owner-Drivers (Contracts and Disputes) Bill 2006

The Order of the Day having been read for the adjourned debate on the second reading of this Bill. Hon Simon O'Brien moved, without notice -

That -

- (1) Order of the Day No. 361, the *Owner-Drivers (Contracts and Disputes) Bill 2006* be discharged and referred to the Standing Committee on Legislation for consideration and report.
- (2) The Committee has the power to consider the policy of the Bill.

23. Questions Without Notice

Ouestions without notice were taken.

The Parliamentary Secretary representing the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure tabled a letter from Brian Burke to the Freedom of Information Co-ordinator, Office of the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure, in response to a question without notice asked by Hon Norman Moore. (Tabled paper 2387).

The Minister for Child Protection tabled documents in relation to employment selection criteria for executive and senior management levels in the department, in response to a question without notice asked by Hon Robyn McSweeney. (Tabled paper 2388).

The Parliamentary Secretary representing the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure tabled maps and area calculations on the Burrup zoned industrial land in the Shire of Roebourne, in response to a question without notice asked by Hon Giz Watson. (Tabled paper 2389).

The Minister for Local Government representing the Minister for Education and Training tabled corrected answers in relation to question on notice No. 4316 and question without notice No. 892. (Tabled paper 2390).

24. Owner-Drivers (Contracts and Disputes) Bill 2006 - Referral

Debate resumed on the motion of Hon Simon O'Brien (cf item 22 above).

Question - put and negatived.

Debate resumed on the second reading of the Bill.

On the motion of the Parliamentary Secretary representing the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure the debate was adjourned to the next sitting.

25. Criminal Law and Evidence Amendment Bill 2006

The Order of the Day having been read for the adjourned debate on the second reading of this Bill.

Debate resumed.

Interruption of Debate [SO 61(b)].

26. Adjournment

The Minister for Local Government moved, That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question - put and passed.

The House adjourned at 10.14pm until Wednesday, 21 March 2007 at 4.00pm.

Members present during the day's proceedings

Attendance: Present all Members.

Member granted leave: Hon Margaret Rowe.

MIA BETJEMAN

HON NICK GRIFFITHS

Clerk of the Legislative Council

President of the Legislative Council